



Notice of a meeting of

Corporate Appeals Panel

To: Councillors Galvin, Gunnell and Waller

Date: Friday, 12 February 2016

Time: 10.00 am

Venue: The King John Room (GO59) - West Offices

AGENDA

1. Election of Chair

To elect a Member to act as Chair of the meeting.

2. Exclusion of Press and Public

To consider excluding the public and press from the meeting during consideration of agenda item 5, (Appeal against Dismissal) on the grounds that it contains information relating to an individual and information which is likely to reveal the identity of an individual. This information is classified as exempt under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972, as revised by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

3. Declarations of Interest

At this point, Members are asked to declare:

- any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests,
- any prejudicial interests or
- any disclosable pecuniary interests

which they may have in respect of business on this agenda.

4. Minutes (Pages 3 - 4)

To approve and sign the minutes of the meeting held on 16 October 2015.

5. Appeal Against Dismissal

To consider an appeal against dismissal under the City of York Council's Disciplinary Procedure.

a) Management Case (Pages 5 - 56)

Papers in support of management's case.

b) Appellant's Case (Pages 57 - 154)

Papers in support of the appellant's case.

c) Joint Supporting Papers (Pages 155 - 282)

Supporting papers relevant to both cases which were presented at the Disciplinary Hearing

For more information about this meeting please contact the Democratic Services Officers responsible for servicing this meeting:

Democracy Officers:

Name: Catherine Clarke and Louise Cook (job share)

Contact Details:

- Telephone – (01904) 551031
- E-mail – catherine.clarke@york.gov.uk and louise.cook@york.gov.uk

(If contacting us by e-mail, please send to both democracy officers named above)

CITY OF YORK COUNCIL
CORPORATE APPEALS PANEL
(Disciplinary Dismissals)

Procedure

The procedure for the appeal will be as follows:

- The appellant and/or his/her representative and the Management (officer(s) appearing for the Council) are invited into the meeting.
- The Chair of the Panel will introduce all parties present and explain procedural matters.
- The Chair will invite the appellant/representative to confirm the reason(s) for the appeal.
- Management will present the Council's case and will call and question any supporting witnesses he/she considers necessary.
- Following the presentation of the Council's case, the Chair will invite the appellant/representative to put questions to Management/witnesses.
- The appellant or his/her representative will present his/her case and will call and question any supporting witnesses he/she considers necessary.
- Following the presentation of the appellant's case, the Chair will invite Management to put questions to the appellant or his/her representative/witnesses.
- Members will ask both parties to sum up (please note that no new evidence can be introduced at this stage)
- Members can asks questions of both parties at any stage during the appeal.

- Any party may call for a reasonable recess during the appeal hearing.
- Once the case for and against the appeal has been heard, the Chair will call for an adjournment for the panel to make their decision.
- Both parties will leave the room while Members, advised by Human Resources, make their decision.

Decision

- Members will debate the case and decide which one or more of the four legal reasons for appeal are applicable.
- Depending on the reason for appeal, Members will decide whether the grounds for appeal are sustained and whether or not to uphold the original decision that the employee did commit a disciplinary offence.
- Members will decide whether or not to uphold the original penalty.
- The reasons for Members decisions will be recorded.
- The outcome of the appeal will be communicated in writing to all parties within five working days of the decision being made.

City of York Council

Committee Minutes

Meeting	Corporate Appeals Panel
Date	16 October 2015
Present	Councillors Galvin, Gillies and Reid

11. Election of Chair

Resolved: That Councillor Galvin be elected to chair the meeting.

12. Exclusion of Press and Public

Resolved: That the press and public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of agenda item 5 (Appeal against Dismissal) on the grounds that it contains information relating to an individual and information which is likely to reveal the identity of an individual. This information is classified as exempt under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972, as revised by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

13. Declarations of Interest

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, any prejudicial interests or disclosable pecuniary interests which they may have in respect of the business on the agenda. None were declared.

14. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the meeting held on 7 August 2015 be approved and signed by the chair as a correct record.

15. Appeal Against Dismissal

The Panel considered an appeal against dismissal under the Council's Disciplinary Procedure.

The hearing was attended by the Head of Facilities Management , who presented the management case and an Employee Relations Advisor advising management. The appellant was in attendance at the hearing but chose to attend the hearing unaccompanied. An HR Business Partner was also in attendance to provide HR advice to the Panel.

The Panel considered all the evidence provided in the agenda papers and verbally at the hearing by both parties, including two additional witness statements provided by the appellant at the hearing which were accepted as additional evidence. The Panel also took into account evidence provided at the hearing by one witness who was called in support of management's case.

Having considered all the available information, the Panel concluded that allegation 1 was not proven but that allegation 2 was proven. The Panel noted that, on its own, allegation 2 constituted gross misconduct and that in the absence of reasonable mitigation the normal penalty was summary dismissal.

Resolved: That the appeal not be upheld.

Reason: The Panel felt that the decision taken by management to dismiss the appellant was fair and reasonable in all the circumstances of the case and in accordance with the Council's Disciplinary Procedure.

Councillor Galvin, Chair

[The meeting started at 10.00 am and finished at 12.05 pm].

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank